Clinical and Genetic Association of Serum Paraoxonase and Arylesterase Activities With Cardiovascular Risk


Objective—Diminished serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities (measures of paraoxonase-1 [PON-1] function) in humans have been linked to heightened systemic oxidative stress and atherosclerosis risk. The clinical prognostic use of measuring distinct PON-1 activities has not been established, and the genetic determinants of PON-1 activities are not known.

Methods and Results—We established analytically robust high-throughput assays for serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities and measured these in 3668 stable subjects undergoing elective coronary angiography without acute coronary syndrome and were prospectively followed for major adverse cardiovascular events (MACE= death, myocardial infarction, stroke) over 3 years. Low serum arylesterase and paraoxonase activities were both associated with increased risk for MACE, with arylesterase activity showing greatest prognostic value (quartile 4 versus quartile 1; hazard ratio 2.63; 95% CI, 1.97–3.50; P=0.01). Arylesterase remained significant after adjusting for traditional risk factors, C-reactive protein, and creatinine clearance (hazard ratio, 2.20; 95% CI, 1.60–3.02; P=0.01), predicted future development of MACE in both primary and secondary prevention populations, and reclassified risk categories incrementally to traditional clinical variables. A genome-wide association study identified distinct single nucleotide polymorphisms within the PON-1 gene that were highly significantly associated with serum paraoxonase (1.18×10^{-303}) or arylesterase (4.99×10^{-116}) activity but these variants were not associated with either 3-year MACE risk in an angiographic cohort (n=2136) or history of either coronary artery disease or myocardial infarction in the Coronary Artery Disease Genome-Wide Replication and Meta-Analysis consortium (n=80,000 subjects).

Conclusion—Diminished serum arylesterase activity, but not the genetic determinants of PON-1 functional measures, provides incremental prognostic value and clinical reclassification of stable subjects at risk of developing MACE. (Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol. 2012;32:2803-2812.)

Key Words: paraoxonase 1 gene ■ coronary artery disease ■ oxidative stress ■ arylesterase activity

Heavily oxidized stress in the form of oxidation of lipids and proteins by reactive oxidant species adversely contributes to disease progression in cardiovascular disease.1 Paraoxonase-1 (PON-1) belongs to a family of high-density lipoprotein–associated enzymes that show hydrolytic activity toward a variety of substrates, including toxins in the environment2 and oxidized lipids in the body.3 Consequently, diminished activities of PON-1 and other paraoxonases have been associated with the development of cardiovascular disease.4,5 PON-1 (EC 3.1.1.2) activity in serum is classically named after the substrate used to monitor enzymatic function, namely, paraoxonase activity (using paraoxon as substrate) and arylesterase activity (using phenyl acetate as substrate).6

Our group has recently observed the relationship between a specific PON-1 genotype and functional activity with multiple systemic measures of oxidative stress and cardiovascular disease risk in humans.7,8 Based on these encouraging findings, we developed analytically validated semiautomated high throughput methods for arylesterase and paraoxonase activity assays amenable to large scale clinical and genetic studies. We sought to expand and validate our findings in an independent cohort of stable patients undergoing cardiac evaluation to examine and contrast the potential role of distinct circulating PON-1 activity measures to predict adverse disease progression. In addition, we sought to identify genetic loci controlling paraoxonase and arylesterase activity by carrying...
out an unbiased genome-wide association study (GWAS) and determine whether these genetic factors were associated with incident risks of adverse cardiac events or prevalent coronary artery disease (CAD).

Patients and Methods

Study Population

The Cleveland Clinic GeneBank study is a large, prospective cohort study from 2001 to 2006 that established a well-characterized clinical repository with clinical and longitudinal outcomes data obtained from consenting subjects undergoing an elective diagnostic cardiac catheterization procedure. All the GeneBank participants gave written informed consent approved by the Cleveland Clinic Institutional Review Board.

This study involved a total of 3668 subjects in the GeneBank study who underwent coronary angiography in the absence of acute coronary syndrome and confirmed by including only those with cardiac troponin I <0.05 ng/mL, with no history of revascularization within 30 days before enrollment, and with at least 3 years of long-term follow-up. Adjudicated outcomes were ascertained over the ensuing 3 years for all subjects after enrollment. Framingham risk factors age, sex, cigarette smoking, low-density lipoprotein and high-density lipoprotein cholesterol, systolic blood pressure, and diabetes mellitus were identified. We defined secondary prevention cohort by a known history of CAD (including stenosis of any coronary artery ≥50% at the time of catheterization), prior myocardial infarction (MI), known history of peripheral artery disease, history of transient ischemic attack, stroke, or known cerebrovascular disease, or previous percutaneous or surgical revascularization. Those who did not fulfill secondary prevention cohort criteria were assigned to primary prevention cohort.

An estimate of creatinine clearance was calculated using the Cockcroft–Gault equation, because a majority of the patients have preserved renal function. High-sensitivity C-reactive protein (hsCRP), cardiac troponin I, serum creatinine, fasting blood glucose, and lipid profiles were also measured on the Architect c8000 platform (Abbott Laboratories, Abbott Park, IL). Absolute neutrophil counts were analyzed by the Advia 120 Automated Hematology Analyzer (Siemens Healthcare Diagnostics, Deerfield, IL). Major adverse cardiovascular events (MACE) were defined as death, nonfatal MI, or nonfatal cerebrovascular accident after enrollment.

Serum Paraoxonase Activity and Arylesterase Activity Assays

Serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities were measured by spectrophotometry in an open channel on the aforementioned Architect c8000 platform, and in a 96-well plate format (Spectramax 384 Plus, Molecular Devices, Sunnyvale, CA), respectively. For serum paraoxonase activity, the rate of generation of paranitrophenol was determined at 405 nm in 40-fold diluted serum (final) in reaction mixtures composed of 1.5 mmol/L paraoxon (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO), 10 mmol/L Tris hydrochloride, pH 8, 1 mol/L sodium chloride, and 2 mmol/L calcium chloride at 24°C. An extinction coefficient (at 405 nm) of 17000 mol·L⁻¹·cm⁻¹ was used for calculating units of paraoxonase activity, which is expressed as nanomoles of paranitrophenol produced per minute per milliliter of serum. The intra-assay and interassay coefficients of variance for the high-throughput paraoxonase activity assay were 1.9% and 3.3%, respectively, on 30 replicates performed on 15 different days. For serum arylesterase activity measurement, initial hydrolysis rates were determined at 270 nm in 50-fold diluted serum (final) in reactions mixtures composed of 3.4 mmol/L phenylacetate (Sigma-Aldrich), 9 mmol/L Tris hydrochloride, pH 8, and 0.9 mmol/L calcium chloride at 24°C. An extinction coefficient (at 270 nm) of 1310 mol·L⁻¹·cm⁻¹ was used for calculating units of arylesterase activity, which are expressed as micromoles of phenyl acetate hydroxylized per minute per milliliter of serum. The intra-assay and interassay coefficients of variance for arylesterase activity assay were 3.4% and 3.9%, respectively, on 20 replicates performed on 10 different days.

Genotyping

Genotyping was performed on the Affymetrix Genome-Wide Human single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) Array 6.0 platform. Using these data and those from 120 phased chromosomes from the HapMap CEU samples (HapMap r22 release, National Center for Biotechnology Information build 36), genotypes were imputed for untyped SNPs across the genome using MACH 1.0 software. All imputations were done on the forward (+) strand using 562545 genotyped SNPs that had passed quality control filters. QC filters for the imputed data set excluded SNPs with Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium P values <0.0001 or minor allele frequencies <1%, and individuals with <95% call rates. This resulted in 2421770 autosomal SNPs that were available for analysis.

Statistical Analyses

The Student t test or Wilcoxon-Rank sum test for continuous variables and χ² test for categorical variables were used to examine the difference between the groups. Kaplan–Meier analysis with Cox proportional hazards regression was used for time-to-event analysis to determine hazard ratio (HR) and 95% CI for MACE. Adjustments were made for individual traditional cardiac risk factor (including age, sex, diabetes mellitus, hypertension, former or current cigarette smoking, prior CAD), log-transformed hsCRP, and creatinine clearance. The R package Mclust was used for discriminant analysis. The optimal model parameters and the number of clusters were determined via Bayesian information criterion. All analyses were performed using R 2.13.1 (Vienna, Austria) and P values <0.05 were considered statistically significant.

Genome-wide linear regression analyses were used to identify loci associated with serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activity after adjustment for age and sex under an additive model. Genetic analyses were carried out with PLINK (v1.07) using both untransformed (arylesterase activity) and inverse-normal transformed (paraoxonase activity) values. Relative risk for experiencing a MACE as a function of genotype was assessed using Cox proportional hazard models with adjustment for age, sex, Framingham ATP-III risk score (which includes diabetes mellitus status), and medication use (aspirin and statins). Adjusted HR and 95% CI are reported with 2-sided P values. A haplotype score test was also used to test all haplotypes with >1% frequency, as implemented in the HaploStats package. All genetic analyses were performed using SAS version 9.2 (SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC) or R 2.10.1 (http://www.R-project.org).

Associations With CAD

The Coronary Artery Disease Genome-Wide Replication and Metaanalysis (CARDioGRAM) Consortium represents a GWAS meta-analysis of CAD comprising a discovery set of ≈22000 cases and ≈65 000 controls. For each cohort in CARDioGRAM, logistic regression was first used to test for association with CAD using a log-additive model with adjustment for age and sex and taking into account the uncertainty of possibly imputed genotypes. Subsequently, a meta-analysis was performed separately for every SNP from each study that passed the quality control criteria using a fixed effect model with inverse variance weighting. The results of this default meta-analysis were used to determine whether SNPs influencing PON-1 functional activity measures were associated with CAD.

Results

Study Population

Table 1 describes the baseline characteristics of our primary study population of 3668 subjects. Serum arylesterase activity levels were normally distributed, with a mean of 104±25 μmol·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹. However, serum paraoxonase activity levels were not normally distributed, with a median

Statistical Analyses

The Student t test or Wilcoxon-Rank sum test for continuous variables and χ² test for categorical variables were used to examine the difference between the groups. Kaplan–Meier analysis with Cox proportional hazards regression was used for time-to-event analysis to determine hazard ratio (HR) and 95% CI for MACE. Adjustments were made for individual traditional cardiac risk factor (including age, sex, diabetes mellitus, hypertension, former or current cigarette smoking, prior CAD), log-transformed hsCRP, and creatinine clearance. The R package Mclust was used for discriminant analysis. The optimal model parameters and the number of clusters were determined via Bayesian information criterion. All analyses were performed using R 2.13.1 (Vienna, Austria) and P values <0.05 were considered statistically significant.

Genome-wide linear regression analyses were used to identify loci associated with serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activity after adjustment for age and sex under an additive model. Genetic analyses were carried out with PLINK (v1.07) using both untransformed (arylesterase activity) and inverse-normal transformed (paraoxonase activity) values. Relative risk for experiencing a MACE as a function of genotype was assessed using Cox proportional hazard models with adjustment for age, sex, Framingham ATP-III risk score (which includes diabetes mellitus status), and medication use (aspirin and statins). Adjusted HR and 95% CI are reported with 2-sided P values. A haplotype score test was also used to test all haplotypes with >1% frequency, as implemented in the HaploStats package. All genetic analyses were performed using SAS version 9.2 (SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC) or R 2.10.1 (http://www.R-project.org).

Associations With CAD

The Coronary Artery Disease Genome-Wide Replication and Metaanalysis (CARDioGRAM) Consortium represents a GWAS meta-analysis of CAD comprising a discovery set of ≈22000 cases and ≈65 000 controls. For each cohort in CARDioGRAM, logistic regression was first used to test for association with CAD using a log-additive model with adjustment for age and sex and taking into account the uncertainty of possibly imputed genotypes. Subsequently, a meta-analysis was performed separately for every SNP from each study that passed the quality control criteria using a fixed effect model with inverse variance weighting. The results of this default meta-analysis were used to determine whether SNPs influencing PON-1 functional activity measures were associated with CAD.

Results

Study Population

Table 1 describes the baseline characteristics of our primary study population of 3668 subjects. Serum arylesterase activity levels were normally distributed, with a mean of 104±25 μmol·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹. However, serum paraoxonase activity levels were not normally distributed, with a median

Statistical Analyses

The Student t test or Wilcoxon-Rank sum test for continuous variables and χ² test for categorical variables were used to examine the difference between the groups. Kaplan–Meier analysis with Cox proportional hazards regression was used for time-to-event analysis to determine hazard ratio (HR) and 95% CI for MACE. Adjustments were made for individual traditional cardiac risk factor (including age, sex, diabetes mellitus, hypertension, former or current cigarette smoking, prior CAD), log-transformed hsCRP, and creatinine clearance. The R package Mclust was used for discriminant analysis. The optimal model parameters and the number of clusters were determined via Bayesian information criterion. All analyses were performed using R 2.13.1 (Vienna, Austria) and P values <0.05 were considered statistically significant.

Genome-wide linear regression analyses were used to identify loci associated with serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activity after adjustment for age and sex under an additive model. Genetic analyses were carried out with PLINK (v1.07) using both untransformed (arylesterase activity) and inverse-normal transformed (paraoxonase activity) values. Relative risk for experiencing a MACE as a function of genotype was assessed using Cox proportional hazard models with adjustment for age, sex, Framingham ATP-III risk score (which includes diabetes mellitus status), and medication use (aspirin and statins). Adjusted HR and 95% CI are reported with 2-sided P values. A haplotype score test was also used to test all haplotypes with >1% frequency, as implemented in the HaploStats package. All genetic analyses were performed using SAS version 9.2 (SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC) or R 2.10.1 (http://www.R-project.org).
of 562 μmol·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹ (interquartile range, 315–1045 μmol·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹). Both serum paraoxonase and arylesterase levels were lower in men than in women. Compared with those in the highest quartile, subjects in the lowest quartile of serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activity were more likely to have significantly obstructive (≥50% stenosis) CAD (odds ratio, 1.86 [95% CI, 1.53–2.27] P<0.01 for arylesterase, and 1.48 [95% CI, 1.22–1.81] P<0.01 for paraoxonase). However on adjustment of cardiovascular risk factors, such differences were no longer apparent. In addition, there were very weak (but statistically significant) correlations between serum arylesterase activity and leukocyte count (r=0.02; P=0.28) or absolute neutrophil count (r=0.002; P=0.91). These findings were similar when correlations were performed within the Q192R genotype subgroups (data not shown).

### PON-1 Activities and Major Adverse Cardiac Outcomes

In the 3668 subjects, a total of 417 cardiac events were recorded within the 3-year period of follow-up. Lower serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activity levels were associated with poorer long-term outcomes when stratified by quartiles (Table 2, Figure 1). After adjusting for Framingham risk factors, estimated creatinine clearance, diabetes mellitus and log-transformed hsCRP, lower serum arylesterase activity (HR 2.20 [95% CI, 1.60–3.02]; P<0.01) and to a lesser extent lower serum paraoxonase activity (HR 1.39 [95% CI, 1.04–1.85]; P=0.05) demonstrated increased risk in developing future MACE. Even when cardiac troponin I levels were added to the model (within the normal range of 0.001–0.029 mg/dL), lower serum arylesterase levels still maintain a 2-fold increased risk in MACE at 3 years (HR, 2.04 [95% CI, 1.49–2.79]; P<0.01). The separation is particularly apparent between the lowest quartile and the upper 3 quartiles at the cutoff of 87 μmol·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹ (Figure 1). The addition of serum arylesterase activity or serum paraoxonase activity to the model results in significant improvement in risk classification with net reclassification index of 7.9% for arylesterase activity (P=0.003) and 7.2% for paraoxonase activity (P=0.002). The prognostic value of serum arylesterase activity was observed within the secondary prevention cohort (Table 2), as well as within subjects who demonstrated a recent normal catheterization (ie, no significant [>50%] angiographic evidence of CAD in any major vessel or preceding history of CAD, the primary prevention cohort; Table 2). Serum arylesterase activity also remained a prognostic indicator within each Framingham risk factor subcohort and among those with low hsCRP (Figure 2), or in those without statin therapy (n=1512). In addition to serum arylesterase remaining a significant predictor of MACE after addition of higher sensitivity troponin testing to traditional risk factors and laboratory risk markers in the models, we further observed an increased risk of developing subclinical myocardial necrosis (troponin levels that are detectable but remain below the 99th percentile diagnostic cutoff among healthy subjects used to define cutoff for MI) with decreasing quartiles of serum arylesterase levels (odds ratio 2.01 [95% CI, 1.53–2.64]; P<0.001; Figure 3); this trend was not observed with serum paraoxonase activity levels (Figure 3).

### GWAS for PON-1 Activities

We next performed a GWAS for serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activity in 2136 GeneBank subjects (all of Caucasian ancestry) for whom both genotype and PON-1 functional data were available. The genomic inflation factors for paraoxonase and arylesterase activity were 1.015 and 1.013, respectively, indicating that the GWAS results were not confounded by underlying population stratification, and the Q-Q plots are shown in Figure I in the online-only Data Supplement. Serum paraoxonase activity was controlled by a major locus on chromosome 7 containing the PON-1, PON-2, and PON-3 genes (Figure 4A). The lead SNP for serum paraoxonase activity at this locus (rs2057681) is located within the PON-1 gene and yielded a highly significant P value of 1.18×10⁻¹⁰³ (Figure 4A, Table 3). Based on our genotype data, rs2057681 is in near complete linkage disequilibrium (LD) (r²=0.99) with a functional amino acid substitution in PON-1 (rs662; Q192R), which is also associated with increased paraoxonase activity (P=3.31×10⁻⁸⁵; Table 3). Of interest, while rs2057681 and rs662 are associated with significant
increase in paraoxonase activity, they are also associated with significant decrease in arylesterase activity (Table 3). Another known coding SNP in PON-1 (rs854560; L55M) exhibited significant association with paraoxonase activity as well (P=1.27×10⁻⁴⁰; Table 3) but is in relatively weak LD (r²=0.20) with the aforementioned lead SNPs (rs2057681 and rs662). The GWAS analysis for serum arylesterase activity also revealed that this chromosome 7 region was the major locus controlling this measure of PON-1 functional activity (Figure 4B). For example, the lead SNP for serum arylesterase activity, rs854572, is located in the promoter region of PON-1 and not in LD with variants in the lead SNPs on chromosome 7 influenced other CAD risk factors but did not observe any significant evidence for such associations (Table I in the online-only Data Supplement). Because body mass index and statin use have been shown to potentially affect serum paraoxonase activity,¹¹–¹³ we also adjusted the genetic analyses for these potential confounders. However, the strength of the association of the lead SNPs with paraoxonase and arylesterase activities was not diminished when either body mass index or statin use alone was included with age and sex in the genetic models or in a fully adjusted model that included all 4 covariates (Table II in the online-only Data Supplement). Thus, the effect of the lead SNPs on paraoxonase and arylesterase activities are robust and independent of traditional cardiovascular risk factors.

Given the strong effect of the chromosome 7 locus on PON-1 function, we also carried out GWAS analyses for paraoxonase and arylesterase activity conditioned on the lead SNP for each respective trait. These analyses did not reveal other loci in the genome that were significantly associated with either measure of PON-1 activity. To gain further insight into the effect of the chromosome 7 variants on PON-1 function, we also examined the relationship between serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities in our cohort. As illustrated in Figure 5,
both activities were significantly correlated overall (r=0.30; P<0.001) and exhibited a striking grouping of 3 distinct patterns when plotted against each other. These 3 clusters were found to correspond nearly exactly with the 3 genotype groups of the Q192R (rs662) polymorphism (Figure 5A), with 97.2% with the genotype QQ in the top cluster, 97.2% with genotype QR in the middle cluster, and 91.3% with genotype RR in the bottom cluster. However, such a pattern was not observed with the 3 genotype groups of the lead SNP for serum arylesterase activity (rs854572; G>C, Figure 5B). Quantitative analysis of the separation of the 3 genotypes, GG, GC, and CC, across the 3 clusters showed 50.7% with genotype CG in the top cluster, 48.4% with genotype CG in the middle cluster, and 51.4% with genotype CG in the bottom cluster.

Figure 1. Kaplan–Meier analysis for long-term major adverse cardiac events stratified by serum arylesterase (left column) and paraoxonase (right column) activities quartiles in overall (top row), secondary prevention (middle row), and primary prevention (bottom row) populations.
Association of PON-1 Variants With Incident MACE and Prevalent Cardiovascular Disease

We next sought to determine whether the lead variants influencing paraoxonase and arylesterase activity were associated with the development of MACE. These analyses included the 2136 subjects used in the quantitative association described above plus an additional 567 subjects for whom genotype and MACE data were also available (total n=2703). As shown in Table 4, there were no individual effects of the Q192R (rs662) and L55M (rs854560) substitutions on incident risk of MACE in GeneBank subjects. Given the differential effects of the associated variants on PON-1 function (eg, rs662 is associated with increase in paraoxonase activity but decrease in arylesterase activity), we also constructed haplotypes with rs662, rs854560, rs854570, and rs854572 and specifically tested the ATAG haplotype, which leads to modest decreases in both paraoxonase and arylesterase activity (data not shown). However, risk of future MACE was not significantly increased in subjects carrying 1 (HR=0.96; 95% CI, 0.68–1.35) or 2 (HR=0.91; 95% CI, 0.50–1.63) copies of this haplotype (P=0.72; Table 4). Similarly, an analysis using a haplotype score test that included all haplotypes with >1% frequency also did not reveal any associations with MACE (data not shown).

To further evaluate the genetic contribution of these SNPs to cardiovascular risk, we used the large CARDioGRAM consortium, which comprises ≈80,000 case–controls subjects. As shown in Table 5, no significant evidence for association of these SNPs was observed with risk of prevalent CAD. A subanalysis with only cases that had a positive history for MI also did not reveal any associations (Table 5).

Discussion

PON-1 is an atherosclerosis protective enzyme associated with high-density lipoprotein and systemic antioxidant function. Its catalytic activity within crude serum mixtures has traditionally been measured by quantifying enzymatic hydrolysis rates of 2 known in vitro substrates, with functional activities named paraoxonase and arylesterase activities.4,5 There are several novel findings in this report that describe the clinical and genetic associations of PON-1 activities with cardiovascular risks that differ from prior observations from smaller cohorts. First, we demonstrated the prognostic value of serum arylesterase activity (and to a lesser extent serum paraoxonase activity) in predicting long-term cardiovascular risk in a wide range of subjects already treated with contemporary medical therapy. We observed that diminished serum arylesterase activity, particularly within the lowest quartile range, was predictive of adverse long-term cardiac events independent of standard clinical and biochemical risk factors and provided incremental value in reclassifying subjects who are at higher risk of long-term MACE. Furthermore, the prognostic value of serum arylesterase activity was evident in both primary as well as secondary prevention subjects. The fact that arylesterase activity provided prognostic value consistently within subjects with or without underlying angiographic evidence of significant CAD implies that a lack of systemic antioxidant defense mechanisms (a primary function of PON-1) may both promote greater vulnerability to oxidative stress, as well as increase risk for development and progression of CAD in subjects. Moreover, the ability of low serum arylesterase activity...
to identify those at significant increased risk of MACE, even among primary prevention subjects with recent coronary angiographic data showing <50% stenosis in all major coronary vessels, suggests this assay has prognostic value and can identify a vulnerable cohort of subjects who otherwise are not identified as being at high risk. Taken together, the present results suggest that enzymatic activity measures with arylesterase, more so than paraoxonase, serve as a powerful prognostic indicator of cardiovascular risk in a broad spectrum of subjects.

Studies on PON-1 activities have relied on quantifying its wide range of enzymatic activities in breaking down in vitro substrates like paraoxon (paraoxonase activity) and phenylacetate (arylesterase activity). These activities are often reported together and the findings are commonly concordant. Hence, the distinction between serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities in predicting future adverse cardiac events is somewhat unexpected, even though historically the correlation between these 2 measures has not been particularly tight. The unique relationship between the 2 PON-1 activity measurements is largely the result of a very strong association between serum paraoxonase activity and its underlying genetic determinants, which may also explain why serum arylesterase activity is normally distributed whereas serum paraoxonase activity was not. Meanwhile, the strong association between the PON gene cluster and serum arylesterase activity confirms the long-standing assumption that this locus harbors important genetic determinants of serum arylesterase activity.

The significant genetic associations revealed by the GWAS analyses for paraoxonase and arylesterase activities are of further interest for several reasons. First, there was a stronger relationship between serum paraoxonase activity levels and its genetic determinants than those with serum arylesterase activity. Second, our results confirm the strong association of PON-1 variants with serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities and demonstrate that the 2 measured enzymatic functions are associated in a Mendelian-like fashion by a single, major locus on chromosome 7 containing the PON gene cluster. This is supported by the
GWAS analyses conditioned on the lead SNPs, which did not identify other genomic regions associated with either paraoxonase or arylesterase activity. Furthermore, the lead SNPs for either enzymatic activity localize to the PON-1 gene, are distinct from each other, and are not in LD with SNPs in the neighboring PON-3 and PON-2 genes. However, although the PON-1 variants exhibited strong (if not opposed) effects on PON function, they were not associated with future risk of MACE, either individually or as a haplotype that modestly decreased both paraoxonase and arylesterase activity. These results are consistent with our analyses from the CARDIoGRAM consortium, which did not reveal an association of these SNPs with either prevalent CAD or history of MI in ≈80,000 subjects. It should be noted, however, that because the lead SNPs only contributed to an estimated 15% of the PON-1 activity variation, other processes, such as posttranslational modifications, could also play a role in determining the ultimate functionality of PON-1. For example, PON-1 is known to be sensitive to posttranslational oxidative modification and inactivation. 14 It is also possible that our study was underpowered to detect genetic effects on prospective risk of MACE because only 311 subjects out of the ≈2700 subjects included in these analyses experienced a MACE over 3 years of follow-up.

Table 3. Mean Serum Paraoxonase and Arylesterase Activity as a Function of Genotype for Lead SNPs on Chromosome 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position (bp)*</th>
<th>SNP</th>
<th>Alleles†</th>
<th>MAF‡</th>
<th>Serum Paraoxonase Activity, nmoles·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹</th>
<th>Serum Arylesterase Activity, μmoles·min⁻¹·mL⁻¹</th>
<th>P Value‡</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>94774065</td>
<td>rs2269829</td>
<td>A/G</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>389±269 (n=1078)</td>
<td>105±25 (n=1108)</td>
<td>3.27×10⁻⁸⁸</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94775382</td>
<td>rs662 (Q192R)</td>
<td>A/G</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>382±261 (n=1062)</td>
<td>105±25 (n=1088)</td>
<td>3.31×10⁻⁸⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94776193</td>
<td>rs2057681</td>
<td>A/G</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>377±253 (n=1055)</td>
<td>105±25 (n=1080)</td>
<td>1.18×10⁻⁸³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94784020</td>
<td>rs854560 (L55M)</td>
<td>A/T</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>906±489 (n=877)</td>
<td>109±23 (n=868)</td>
<td>3.31×10⁻²⁹⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94790628</td>
<td>rs854570</td>
<td>A/C</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>670±470 (n=898)</td>
<td>91±21 (n=920)</td>
<td>2.90×10⁻⁵⁰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94792332</td>
<td>rs854572</td>
<td>G/C</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>572±407 (n=645)</td>
<td>88±21 (n=659)</td>
<td>1.23×10⁻²⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94793157</td>
<td>rs705382</td>
<td>G/C</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>670±470 (n=897)</td>
<td>91±21 (n=919)</td>
<td>2.92×10⁻⁵⁰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94793464</td>
<td>rs757158</td>
<td>C/T</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>569±403 (n=725)</td>
<td>89±22 (n=741)</td>
<td>3.97×10⁻³⁸</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SNPs indicate single nucleotide polymorphisms; MAF, minor allele frequency.

Data are shown as mean±SD as a function of carrying 0, 1, or 2 copies of the minor alleles for lead genome-wide association study SNPs.

* Base pair positions on chromosome 7 are given according to National Center for Biotechnology Information build 36.1 of the reference human genome sequence.

† Major/minor alleles are given for Caucasians based on the forward (+) DNA strand.

‡ P values are obtained from multiple linear regression using inverse normal-transformed values for paraoxonase activity and untransformed values for arylesterase activity, adjusted for age and sex.

Figure 5. Relationship between serum arylesterase and paraoxonase activity levels stratified according to (A) the lead single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) for serum paraoxonase activity (rs662; Q192R); (B) the lead SNP for serum arylesterase activity (rs854572; G>C). Percentages reflect separation of the 3 genotypes within each stratified cluster of each genotype.
Table 4. Association of Variants Controlling Plasma Paraoxonase or Arylesterase Activity With MACE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SNP/Haplotype</th>
<th>HR (95% CI)</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rs2057681</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (n=1341)</td>
<td>1.18 (0.94–1.49)</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=1155)</td>
<td>0.94 (0.60–1.49)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=207)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rs854572</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (n=794)</td>
<td>1.18 (0.91–1.54)</td>
<td>0.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=1358)</td>
<td>1.12 (0.81–1.56)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=551)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATAG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (n=1212)</td>
<td>0.96 (0.68–1.35)</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=1236)</td>
<td>0.91 (0.50–1.63)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=255)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MACE indicates major adverse cardiovascular events; SNPs indicate single nucleotide polymorphisms; HR, hazard ratio.

HRs are shown as a function of carrying 0, 1, or 2 copies of the minor allele for the lead SNP for paraoxonase (rs2057681) and arylesterase (rs854572) activity or the ATAG haplotype of rs662, rs854560, rs854570, and rs854572. HR are adjusted for age, sex, Framingham ATP-III risk score, and medication use (aspirin and statins). 2703 subjects were used in these analyses, of which 311 experienced a MACE (death, MI, or stroke) over 3 y of follow-up.

The lack of associations between the lead SNPs for PON and arylesterase activities with CAD and MI risks in humans in our study are in direct contrast to what has been observed in mice where PON-1 deficiency leads to increased aortic lesion formation and transgenic mice over expressing PON-1 are protected. It is of interest that the PON-1 transgenic mouse models demonstrating protective effects have 50% to 400% increased serum arylesterase activity, far in excess of the modest changes in activity associated with the peak SNP identified in the arylesterase GWAS. If arylesterase activity is the more important atheroprotective aspect of PON-1 function, as our clinical associations with MACE suggest, then it may not be surprising that an association was not observed with the SNPs identified. For example, the lead SNP for arylesterase activity (rs854572) only increases activity by ~16% per minor allele copy. It is, thus, possible that the genetic effects on arylesterase activity from this SNP are too weak to observe, especially if a minimum biological threshold of activity change is needed to influence risk of prevalent CAD, history of MI, or incident risk of MACE.

The ability for serum arylesterase activity to identify a high-risk population in the primary prevention cohort that just underwent cardiac catheterization and showed no significant evidence of stenoses in any major vessel may have important clinical implications. Even though our subset analysis was limited by the relatively smaller sample size and low event rates, a significant 4-fold increase risk in long-term MACE in these otherwise low risk subjects was identified. Use of serum arylesterase activity may thus have clinical use and help identify an important patient cohort that may warrant more aggressive risk factor reduction treatment strategies who might otherwise not be targeted for aggressive preventive intervention. In addition to low serum arylesterase activity predicting increased risk for MACE in primary prevention subjects, there was a direct association also noted between lower serum arylesterase activity level and increased prevalence of significantly obstructive CAD by angiography. Of note, we did not find a strong relationship between systemic inflammatory biomarkers, such as CRP or leukocyte parameters, with serum arylesterase levels in this group of stable cardiac patients. This observation is consistent with previous reports that distinguished systemic inflammatory from oxidative stress processes.

Several limitations of our study should be noted. Serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities used substrates that are not the endogenous substrates for PON-1, but are used because they are not readily influenced by other esterases/lactonases in serum, and are presumed to reflect the underlying catalytic activity of PON-1. The GWAS results observed demonstrate these assumptions are reasonable, as only genetic variations in the PON-1 gene were observed to be associated with variations in paraoxonase and arylesterase activities. A further potential limitation is that the measurements were only made under fasting conditions at a single time point. Hence, we are unable to determine the variability and prognostic value of level changes over time and the impact of dietary or therapeutic interventions on serum arylesterase activity level. Selection bias may also be present for those undergoing cardiac catheterization for symptomatic evaluation and management of cardiac diseases at a tertiary care setting, but the large sample size and event rates of the patient population, together with careful phenotypic evaluation, including angiographic data, provides unique insights and adequate power to adjust for clinical and biomarker variables.

Table 5. Association of Identified SNPs With Risk of Prevalent CAD and Risk of MI in the CARDioGRAM Consortium

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SNP</th>
<th>Allele</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>OR (95% CI)</th>
<th>P Value</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>OR (95% CI)</th>
<th>P Value</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>rs2269829</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.99 (0.97–1.03)</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>83 324</td>
<td>0.97 (0.94–1.01)</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>52 973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs662</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.99 (0.96–1.02)</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>79 262</td>
<td>0.98 (0.94–1.02)</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>52 306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs2057681</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.99 (0.96–1.02)</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>84 106</td>
<td>0.97 (0.93–1.00)</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>53 649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854560</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854570</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>1.02 (0.99–1.05)</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>81 019</td>
<td>1.01 (0.98–1.05)</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>51 143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854572</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>1.01 (0.99–1.04)</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>83 486</td>
<td>1.00 (0.97–1.04)</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>53 204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs705382</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>1.02 (1.0–1.05)</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>83 367</td>
<td>1.02 (0.98–1.05)</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>53 305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs757158</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.99 (0.96–1.02)</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>78 275</td>
<td>0.99 (0.96–1.03)</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>51 559</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SNP indicates single nucleotide polymorphism; CAD, coronary artery disease; MI, myocardial infarction; OR, odds ratio; N/A, not available; CARDioGRAM, Coronary Artery Disease Genome-Wide Replication And Meta-Analysis.
Conclusions
Diminished serum arylesterase activity can provide incremental prognostic value and clinical reclassification of stable patients at risk of developing MACE, even among primary prevention subjects who just demonstrated no significant coronary stenoses by angiography and might otherwise be dismissed as low risk. Despite the strong genetic effects of the PON locus on serum paraoxonase and arylesterase activities, the identified variants were not associated with risk of incident MACE or prevalent CAD.

Sources of Funding
This research was supported by National Institutes of Health grants P01HL076491-05S328, 5P01HL103453, and the Fondation Leducq. The GeneBank study has been supported by National Institutes of Health grants P01HL098055, R01HL103866, 1P20HL113452, 1R01HL103931, R01ES021801 (Dr Allayee), and the Cleveland Clinic Clinical Research Unit of the Case Western Reserve University Clinical and Translational Sciences Award (UL1TR 000439-06). Dr Hazen is also partially supported by a gift from the Leonard Krieger Fund. The John and Jennifer Ruddy Canadian Cardiovascular Genetics Centre investigators are supported by Canadian Institutes of Health Research (CIHR) #Medical Research Council Operating Grant Program (MOP)-82810, Heart and Stroke Foundation of Ontario (HSFO) #NA6001, CIHR #MOP172605, and CIHR #MOP77682.

Disclosures
Dr Tang has received research grant support from Abbott Laboratories, Inc. Dr Hazen reports being listed as coinventor on pending and issued patents held by the Cleveland Clinic relating to cardiovascular diagnostics and therapeutics. Dr Hazen reports having been paid as a consultant or speaker for the following companies: Abbott Diagnostics, Cleveland Heart Lab, Esperion, Lilly, Liposcience Inc, Merck & Co, Inc, and Pfizer Inc. Dr Hazen reports receiving research funds from Abbott, Cleveland Heart Lab, Liposcience Inc, and Pfizer Inc. Dr Hazen reports having the right to receive royalty payments for inventions or discoveries related to cardiovascular diagnostics or therapeutics from the companies shown below: Abbott Laboratories, Inc, Cleveland Heart Lab, Esperion, Frantz Biomarkers, LLC, Liposcience Inc, and Siemens. The other authors have no conflicts to report. There are no medical writers or editors involved in the preparation of the manuscript.

References
Clinical and Genetic Association of Serum Paraoxonase and Arylesterase Activities With Cardiovascular Risk


Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol. 2012;32:2803-2812; originally published online September 13, 2012;
doi: 10.1161/ATVBAHA.112.253930

Arteriosclerosis, Thrombosis, and Vascular Biology is published by the American Heart Association, 7272 Greenville Avenue, Dallas, TX 75231
Copyright © 2012 American Heart Association, Inc. All rights reserved.
Print ISSN: 1079-5642. Online ISSN: 1524-4636

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:
http://atvb.ahajournals.org/content/32/11/2803

Data Supplement (unedited) at:
http://atvb.ahajournals.org/content/suppl/2012/09/13/ATVBAHA.112.253930.DC1

Permissions: Requests for permissions to reproduce figures, tables, or portions of articles originally published in Arteriosclerosis, Thrombosis, and Vascular Biology can be obtained via RightsLink, a service of the Copyright Clearance Center, not the Editorial Office. Once the online version of the published article for which permission is being requested is located, click Request Permissions in the middle column of the Web page under Services. Further information about this process is available in the Permissions and Rights Question and Answer document.

Reprints: Information about reprints can be found online at:
http://www.lww.com/reprints

Subscriptions: Information about subscribing to Arteriosclerosis, Thrombosis, and Vascular Biology is online at:
http://atvb.ahajournals.org//subscriptions/
Supplement Material

Clinical and Genetic Association of Serum Paraoxonase and Arylesterase Activities with Cardiovascular Risk

W. H. Wilson Tang, MD1,2, Jaana Hartiala, MS3, Yiyeng Fan PhD4, Yuping Wu, PhD4, Alexandre F.R. Stewart PhD5, Jeanette Erdmann PhD6, Sekar Kathiresan MD7, The CARDIoGRAM Consortium8, Robert Roberts MD5, Ruth McPherson MD PhD5, Hooman Allayee PhD3, and Stanley L. Hazen, MD PhD.1,2

1Center for Cardiovascular Diagnostics & Prevention, Department of Cell Biology, Lerner Research Institute, and 2Department of Cardiovascular Medicine, Heart and Vascular Institute, Cleveland Clinic, Cleveland, OH.
3Department of Preventive Medicine and Institute for Genetic Medicine, University of Southern California Keck School of Medicine, Los Angeles, CA.
4Department of Mathematics, Cleveland State University, Cleveland OH.
5John and Jennifer Ruddy Canadian Cardiovascular Genetics Centre, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, Ottawa, Canada.
6Medizinische Klinik II, Universität zu Lübeck, 23538 Lübeck, Germany.
7Center for Human Genetic Research, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston MA.
8A full list of authors and affiliations for the CARDIoGRAM Consortium is provided in the supplemental data.

Address for Correspondence: E-mail: hazens@ccf.org
**Supplemental Table I**  Association of Lead SNPs on Chromosome 7 with Adjustment for BMI and Statin Use.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SNP</th>
<th>Serum Paraoxonase Activity</th>
<th>Serum Arylesterase Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>p-value&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>p-value&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs2269829</td>
<td>3.27 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-288&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4.02 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-288&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs662 (Q192R)</td>
<td>3.31 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-295&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4.36 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-295&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs2057681</td>
<td>1.18 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-303&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1.56 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-303&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854560 (L55M)</td>
<td>1.27 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-140&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1.22 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-140&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854570</td>
<td>2.90 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-09&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>2.87 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-09&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854572</td>
<td>1.23 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-35&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1.18 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-35&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs705382</td>
<td>2.92 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-09&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>2.90 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-09&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs757158</td>
<td>3.97 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-38&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.87 x 10&lt;sup&gt;-38&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup>p-values obtained with adjustment for age and gender.
<sup>b</sup>p-values obtained with adjustment for age, gender, and BMI.
<sup>c</sup>p-values obtained with adjustment for age gender, and statin use.
<sup>d</sup>p-values obtained with adjustment for age, gender, BMI, and statin use.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SNP</th>
<th>Total Cholesterol</th>
<th>LDL cholesterol</th>
<th>HDL cholesterol</th>
<th>^bC-reactive Protein</th>
<th>Creatinine clearance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>rs2269829</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>0.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs662 (Q192R)</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs2057681</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854560 (L55M)</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854570</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs854572</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs705382</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rs757158</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

^aP-values are shown for association of lead SNPs on chromosome 7 with CAD biomarkers, with adjustment for age and gender.

^bLog-transformed prior to analysis.
Supplemental Figure I  Q-Q plots for GWAS of paraoxonase and arylesterase activity.
Supplement: The CARDIoGRAM Consortium

Executive Committee: Sekar Kathiresan\textsuperscript{1,2,3}, Muredach P. Reilly\textsuperscript{4}, Nilesh J. Samani\textsuperscript{5,6}, Heribert Schunkert\textsuperscript{7,79}

Executive Secretary: Jeanette Erdmann\textsuperscript{7,79}

Steering Committee: Themistocles L. Assimes\textsuperscript{8}, Eric Boerwinkle\textsuperscript{9}, Jeanette Erdmann\textsuperscript{7,79} Alistair Hall\textsuperscript{10}, Christian Hengstenberg\textsuperscript{11}, Sekar Kathiresan\textsuperscript{1,2,3}, Inke R. König\textsuperscript{12}, Reijo Laaksonen\textsuperscript{13}, Ruth McPherson\textsuperscript{14}, Muredach P. Reilly\textsuperscript{4}, Nilesh J. Samani\textsuperscript{5,6}, Heribert Schunkert\textsuperscript{7,79}, John R. Thompson\textsuperscript{15}, Unnur Thorsteinsdottir\textsuperscript{16,17}, Andreas Ziegler\textsuperscript{12}

Statisticians: Inke R. König\textsuperscript{12} (chair), John R. Thompson\textsuperscript{15} (chair), Devin Absher\textsuperscript{18}, Li Chen\textsuperscript{19}, L. Adrienne Cupples\textsuperscript{20,21}, Eran Halperin\textsuperscript{22}, Mingyao Li\textsuperscript{23}, Kiran Musunuru\textsuperscript{1,2,3}, Michael Preuss\textsuperscript{12,7}, Arne Schillert\textsuperscript{12}, Gudmar Thorleifsson\textsuperscript{16}, Benjamin F. Voight\textsuperscript{2,3,24}, George A. Wells\textsuperscript{25}

Writing group: Themistocles L. Assimes\textsuperscript{8}, Panos Deloukas\textsuperscript{26}, Jeanette Erdmann\textsuperscript{7,79}, Hilma Holm\textsuperscript{16}, Sekar Kathiresan\textsuperscript{1,2,3}, Inke R. König\textsuperscript{12}, Ruth McPherson\textsuperscript{14}, Muredach P. Reilly\textsuperscript{4}, Robert Roberts\textsuperscript{14}, Nilesh J. Samani\textsuperscript{5,6}, Heribert Schunkert\textsuperscript{7,79}, Alexandre F. R. Stewart\textsuperscript{14}

ADVANCE: Devin Absher\textsuperscript{18}, Themistocles L. Assimes\textsuperscript{8}, Stephen Fortmann\textsuperscript{8}, Alan Go\textsuperscript{27}, Mark Hlatky\textsuperscript{8}, Carlos Iribarren\textsuperscript{27}, Joshua Knowles\textsuperscript{8}, Richard Myers\textsuperscript{18}, Thomas Quertermous\textsuperscript{8}, Steven Sidney\textsuperscript{27}, Neil Risch\textsuperscript{28}, Hua Tang\textsuperscript{29}

CADomes: Stefan Blankenberg\textsuperscript{30}, Tanja Zeller\textsuperscript{30}, Arne Schillert\textsuperscript{12}, Philipp Wild\textsuperscript{30}, Andreas Ziegler\textsuperscript{12}, Renate Schnabel\textsuperscript{30}, Christoph Sinning\textsuperscript{30}, Karl Lackner\textsuperscript{31}, Laurence Tiret\textsuperscript{32}, Viviane Nicaud\textsuperscript{32}, Francois Cambien\textsuperscript{32}, Christoph Bickel\textsuperscript{30}, Hans J. Rupprecht\textsuperscript{30}, Claire Perret\textsuperscript{32}, Carole Proust\textsuperscript{32}, Thomas Münzel\textsuperscript{30}

CHARGE: Maja Barbalic\textsuperscript{33}, Joshua Bis\textsuperscript{34}, Eric Boerwinkle\textsuperscript{9}, Ida Yii-Der Chen\textsuperscript{35}, L. Adrienne Cupples\textsuperscript{20,21}, Abbas Dehghan\textsuperscript{36}, Serkalem Demissie-Banjaw\textsuperscript{37,21}, Aaron Folsom\textsuperscript{38}, Nicole
Glazer\textsuperscript{39}, Vilmundur Gudnason\textsuperscript{40,41}, Tamara Harris\textsuperscript{42}, Susan Heckbert\textsuperscript{43}, Daniel Levy\textsuperscript{21}, Thomas Lumley\textsuperscript{44}, Kristin Marciano\textsuperscript{45}, Alanna Morrison\textsuperscript{46}, Christopher J. O’Donnell\textsuperscript{47}, Bruce M. Psaty\textsuperscript{48}, Kenneth Rice\textsuperscript{49}, Jerome I. Rotter\textsuperscript{35}, David S. Siscovick\textsuperscript{50}, Nicholas Smith\textsuperscript{43}, Albert Smith\textsuperscript{40,41}, Kent D. Taylor\textsuperscript{35}, Cornelia van Duijn\textsuperscript{36}, Kelly Volcik\textsuperscript{46}, Jaqueline Whitteman\textsuperscript{36}, Vasan Ramachandran\textsuperscript{51}, Albert Hofman\textsuperscript{36}, Andre Uitterlinden\textsuperscript{52,36}

deCODE: Solveig Gretarsdottir\textsuperscript{16}, Jeffrey R. Gulcher\textsuperscript{16}, Hilma Holm\textsuperscript{16}, Augustine Kong\textsuperscript{16}, Kari Stefansson\textsuperscript{16,17}, Gudmundur Thorgeirsson\textsuperscript{53,17}, Karl Andersen\textsuperscript{53,17}, Gudmar Thorleifsson\textsuperscript{16}, Unnur Thorsteinsdottir\textsuperscript{16,17}

GERMIFS I and II: Jeanette Erdmann\textsuperscript{7,79}, Marcus Fischer\textsuperscript{11}, Anika Grosshennig\textsuperscript{12,7}, Christian Hengstenberg\textsuperscript{11}, Inke R. König\textsuperscript{12}, Wolfgang Lieb\textsuperscript{54}, Patrick Linsel-Nitschke\textsuperscript{7}, Michael Preuss\textsuperscript{12,7}, Klaus Stark\textsuperscript{11}, Stefan Schreiber\textsuperscript{55}, H.-Erich Wichmann\textsuperscript{56,58,59}, Andreas Ziegler\textsuperscript{12}, Heribert Schunkert\textsuperscript{7,79}

GERMIFS III (KORA): Zouhair Aherrahrou\textsuperscript{7,79}, Petra Bruse\textsuperscript{7,79}, Angela Doering\textsuperscript{56}, Jeanette Erdmann\textsuperscript{7,79}, Christian Hengstenberg\textsuperscript{11}, Thomas Illig\textsuperscript{56}, Norman Klopp\textsuperscript{56}, Inke R. König\textsuperscript{12}, Patrick Diemert\textsuperscript{7}, Christina Loley\textsuperscript{12,7}, Anja Medack\textsuperscript{7,79}, Christina Meisinger\textsuperscript{56}, Thomas Meitinger\textsuperscript{57,60}, Janja Nahrstedt\textsuperscript{12,7}, Annette Peters\textsuperscript{56}, Michael Preuss\textsuperscript{12,7}, Klaus Stark\textsuperscript{11}, Arnika K. Wagner\textsuperscript{7}, H.-Erich Wichmann\textsuperscript{56,58,59}, Christina Willenborg\textsuperscript{7,79}, Andreas Ziegler\textsuperscript{12}, Heribert Schunkert\textsuperscript{7,79}

LURIC/AtheroRemo: Bernhard O. Böhm\textsuperscript{61}, Harald Dobnig\textsuperscript{62}, Tanja B. Grammer\textsuperscript{63}, Eran Halperin\textsuperscript{22}, Michael M. Hoffmann\textsuperscript{64}, Marcus Kleber\textsuperscript{65}, Reijo Laaksonen\textsuperscript{13}, Winfried März\textsuperscript{63,66,67}, Andreas Meinitzer\textsuperscript{66}, Bernhard R. Winkelmann\textsuperscript{68}, Stefan Pilz\textsuperscript{62}, Wilfried Renner\textsuperscript{66}, Hubert Scharnagl\textsuperscript{66}, Tatjana Stojakovic\textsuperscript{66}, Andreas Tomascitz\textsuperscript{62}, Karl Winkler\textsuperscript{64}

**OHGS**: Alexandre F. R. Stewart, Li Chen, Sonny Dandona, George A. Wells, Olga Jarinova, Ruth McPherson, Robert Roberts

**PennCATH/MedStar**: Muredach P. Reilly, Mingyao Li, Liming Qu, Robert Wilensky, William Matthai, Hakon H. Hakonarson, Joe Devaney, Mary Susan Burnett, Augusto D. Pichard, Kenneth M. Kent, Lowell Satler, Joseph M. Lindsay, Ron Waksman, Christopher W. Knouff, Dawn M. Waterworth, Max C. Walker, Vincent Mooser, Stephen E. Epstein, Daniel J. Rader

**WTCCC**: Nilesh J. Samani, John R. Thompson, Peter S. Braund, Christopher P. Nelson, Benjamin J. Wright, Anthony J. Balmforth, Stephen G. Ball, Alistair S. Hall, Wellcome Trust Case Control Consortium

**Affiliations**

1 Cardiovascular Research Center and Cardiology Division, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, MA, USA; 2 Center for Human Genetic Research, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, MA, USA; 3 Program in Medical and Population Genetics, Broad Institute of Harvard and Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), Cambridge, MA, USA; 4 The Cardiovascular Institute, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA; 5 Department of Cardiovascular Sciences, University of Leicester, Glenfield Hospital, Leicester, UK; 6 Leicester National Institute for Health Research Biomedical Research Unit in Cardiovascular Disease, Glenfield
Hospital, Leicester, LE3 9QP, UK; 7 Medizinische Klinik II, Universität zu Lübeck, Lübeck, Germany; 8 Department of Medicine, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA; 9 University of Texas Health Science Center, Human Genetics Center and Institute of Molecular Medicine, Houston, TX, USA; 10 Division of Cardiovascular and Neuronal Remodelling, Multidisciplinary Cardiovascular Research Centre, Leeds Institute of Genetics, Health and Therapeutics, University of Leeds, UK; 11 Klinik und Poliklinik für Innere Medizin II, Universität Regensburg, Regensburg, Germany; 12 Institut für Medizinische Biometrie und Statistik, Universität zu Lübeck, Lübeck, Germany; 13 Science Center, Tampere University Hospital, Tampere, Finland; 14 The John & Jennifer Ruddy Canadian Cardiovascular Genetics Centre, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, Ottawa, Canada; 15 Department of Health Sciences, University of Leicester, Leicester, UK; 16 deCODE Genetics, 101 Reykjavik, Iceland; 17 University of Iceland, Faculty of Medicine, 101 Reykjavik, Iceland; 18 Hudson Alpha Institute, Huntsville, Alabama, USA; 19 Cardiovascular Research Methods Centre, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, 40 Ruskin Street, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada, K1Y 4W7; 20 Department of Biostatistics, Boston University School of Public Health, Boston, MA USA; 21 National Heart, Lung and Blood Institute's Framingham Heart Study, Framingham, MA, USA; 22 The Blavatnik School of Computer Science and the Department of Molecular Microbiology and Biotechnology, Tel-Aviv University, Tel-Aviv, Israel, and the International Computer Science Institute, Berkeley, CA, USA; 23 Biostatistics and Epidemiology, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA; 24 Department of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA; 25 Research Methods, Univ Ottawa Heart Inst; 26 Department of Clinical Sciences, Hypertension and Cardiovascular Diseases, Scania University Hospital, Lund University, Malmö, Sweden; 27 Division of Research, Kaiser Permanente, Oakland, CA, USA; 28 Institute
for Human Genetics, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, CA, USA; 29 Dept Cardiovascular Medicine, Cleveland Clinic; 30 Medizinische Klinik und Poliklinik, Johannes-Gutenberg Universität Mainz, Universitätsmedizin, Mainz, Germany; 31 Institut für Klinische Chemie und Laboratoriumsmediizin, Johannes-Gutenberg Universität Mainz, Universitätsmedizin, Mainz, Germany; 32 INSERM UMRS 937, Pierre and Marie Curie University (UPMC, Paris 6) and Medical School, Paris, France; 33 University of Texas Health Science Center, Human Genetics Center, Houston, TX, USA; 34 Cardiovascular Health Research Unit and Department of Medicine, University of Washington, Seattle, WA USA; 35 Cedars-Sinai Medical Center, Medical Genetics Institute, Los Angeles, CA, USA; 36 Erasmus Medical Center, Department of Epidemiology, Rotterdam, The Netherlands; 37 Boston University, School of Public Health, Boston, MA, USA; 38 University of Minnesota School of Public Health, Division of Epidemiology and Community Health, School of Public Health (A.R.F.), Minneapolis, MN, USA; 39 University of Washington, Cardiovascular Health Research Unit and Department of Medicine, Seattle, WA, USA; 40 Icelandic Heart Association, Kopavogur Iceland; 41 University of Iceland, Reykjavik, Iceland; 42 Laboratory of Epidemiology, Demography, and Biometry, Intramural Research Program, National Institute on Aging, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda MD, USA; 43 University of Washington, Department of Epidemiology, Seattle, WA, USA; 44 University of Washington, Department of Biostatistics, Seattle, WA, USA; 45 University of Washington, Department of Internal Medicine, Seattle, WA, USA; 46 University of Texas, School of Public Health, Houston, TX, USA; 47 National Heart, Lung and Blood Institute, Framingham Heart Study, Framingham, MA and Cardiology Division, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, MA, USA; 48 Center for Health Studies, Group Health, Departments of Medicine, Epidemiology, and Health Services, Seattle, WA, USA; 49 The
Wellcome Trust Sanger Institute, The Wellcome Trust Genome Campus, Hinxton, Cambridge, UK; 50 Cardiovascular Health Research Unit, Departments of Medicine and Epidemiology, University of Washington, Seattle; 51 Boston University Medical Center, Boston, MA, USA; 52 Department of Internal Medicine, Erasmus Medical Center, Rotterdam, The Netherlands; 53 Department of Medicine, Landspitali University Hospital, 101 Reykjavik, Iceland; 54 Boston University School of Medicine, Framingham Heart Study, Framingham, MA, USA; 55 Institut für Klinische Molekularbiologie, Christian-Albrechts Universität, Kiel, Germany; 56 Institute of Epidemiology, Helmholtz Zentrum München – German Research Center for Environmental Health, Neuherberg, Germany; 57 Institut für Humangenetik, Helmholtz Zentrum München, Deutsches Forschungszentrum für Umwelt und Gesundheit, Neuherberg, Germany; 58 Institute of Medical Information Science, Biometry and Epidemiology, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Germany; 59 Klinikum Grosshadern, Munich, Germany; 60 Institut für Humangenetik, Technische Universität München, Germany; 61 Division of Endocrinology and Diabetes, Graduate School of Molecular Endocrinology and Diabetes, University of Ulm, Ulm, Germany; 62 Division of Endocrinology, Department of Medicine, Medical University of Graz, Austria; 63 Synlab Center of Laboratory Diagnostics Heidelberg, Heidelberg, Germany; 64 Division of Clinical Chemistry, Department of Medicine, Albert Ludwigs University, Freiburg, Germany; 65 LURIC non profit LLC, Freiburg, Germany; 66 Clinical Institute of Medical and Chemical Laboratory Diagnostics, Medical University Graz, Austria; 67 Institute of Public Health, Social and Preventive Medicine, Medical Faculty Mannheim, University of Heidelberg, Germany; 68 Cardiology Group Frankfurt-Sachsenhausen, Frankfurt, Germany; 69 Cardiovascular Epidemiology and Genetics Group, Institut Municipal d’Investigació Mèdica, Barcelona; Ciber Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERSP), Spain; 70 Chronic Disease
Epidemiology and Prevention Unit, Department of Chronic Disease Prevention, National Institute for Health and Welfare, Helsinki, Finland; 71 Department of Molecular Biology and Center for Human Genetic Research, Massachusetts General Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Boston, USA; 72 The Center for Applied Genomics, Children’s Hospital of Philadelphia, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA; 73 Cardiovascular Research Institute, Medstar Health Research Institute, Washington Hospital Center, Washington, DC 20010, USA; 74 Genetics Division and Drug Discovery, GlaxoSmithKline, King of Prussia, Pennsylvania 19406, USA; 75 The Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA; 76 Department of Cardiovascular Surgery, University of Leicester, Leicester, UK; 77 Division of Cardiovascular and Diabetes Research, Multidisciplinary Cardiovascular Research Centre, Leeds Institute of Genetics, Health and Therapeutics, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK; 78 LIGHT Research Institute, Faculty of Medicine and Health, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK; 79 Deutsches Zentrum für Herz-Kreislauf-Forschung (DZHK), Universität zu Lübeck, Lübeck, Germany

Sources of Funding

The ADVANCE study was supported by a grant from the Reynold's Foundation and NHLBI grant HL087647.

Genetic analyses of CADomics were supported by a research grant from Boehringer Ingelheim. Recruitment and analysis of the CADomics cohort was supported by grants from Boehringer Ingelheim and PHILIPS medical Systems, by the Government of Rheinland-Pfalz in the context of the “Stiftung Rheinland-Pfalz für Innovation”, the research program “Wissen schafft Zukunft” and by the Johannes-Gutenberg University of Mainz in the context of the “Schwerpunkt Vaskuläre Prävention” and the “MAIFOR grant 2001”, by grants from the Fondation de France,
the French Ministry of Research, and the Institut National de la Santé et de la Recherche Médicale.

The deCODE CAD/MI Study was sponsored by NIH grant, National Heart, Lung and Blood Institute R01HL089650-02.

The German MI Family Studies (GerMIFS I-III (KORA)) were supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft and the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) in the context of the German National Genome Research Network (NGFN-2 and NGFN-plus), the EU funded integrated project Cardiogenics (LSHM-CT-2006-037593) and ENGAGE, and the bi-national BMBF/ANR funded project CARDomics (01KU0908A).

LURIC has received funding from the EU framework 6 funded Integrated Project “Bloodomics” (LSHM-CT-2004-503485), the EU framework 7 funded Integrated Project AtheroRemo (HEALTH-F2-2008-201668) and from Sanofi/Aventis, Roche, Dade Behring/Siemens, and AstraZeneca.

The MiGen study was funded by the US National Institutes of Health (NIH) and National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute’s STAMPEED genomics research program through R01 HL087676. Ron Do from the MiGen study is supported by a Canada Graduate Doctoral Scholarship from the Canadian Institutes of Health Research.

Recruitment of PennCATH was supported by the Cardiovascular Institute of the University of Pennsylvania. Recruitment of the MedStar sample was supported in part by the MedStar Research Institute and the Washington Hospital Center and a research grant from GlaxoSmithKline. Genotyping of PennCATH and Medstar was performed at the Center for Applied Genomics at the Children’s Hospital of Philadelphia and supported by GlaxoSmithKline through an Alternate Drug Discovery Initiative research alliance award (M. P. R. and D. J. R.) with the University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine.
The Ottawa Heart Genomic Study was supported by CIHR #MOP-82810 (R. R.), CFI #11966 (R. R.), HSFO #NA6001 (R. McP.), CIHR #MOP172605 (R. McP.), CIHR #MOP77682 (A. F. R. S.).

The WTCCC Study was funded by the Wellcome Trust. Recruitment of cases for the WTCCC Study was carried out by the British Heart Foundation (BHF) Family Heart Study Research Group and supported by the BHF and the UK Medical Research Council. N. J. S. and S. G. B. hold chairs funded by the British Heart Foundation. N. J. S. and A.H.G are also supported by the Leicester NIHR Biomedical Research Unit in Cardiovascular Disease and the work described in this paper is part of the research portfolio of the Leicester NIHR Biomedical Research Unit.

The Age, Gene/Environment Susceptibility Reykjavik Study has been funded by NIH contract N01-AG-12100, the NIA Intramural Research Program, Hjartavernd (the Icelandic Heart Association), and the Althingi (the Icelandic Parliament).

The Cleveland Clinic GeneBank study was supported by NIH grants P01 HL098055, P01HL076491-06, R01DK080732, P01HL087018, and 1RO1HL103931-01.

The collection of clinical and sociodemographic data in the Dortmund Health Study was supported by the German Migraine- & Headache Society (DMKG) and by unrestricted grants of equal share from Astra Zeneca, Berlin Chemie, Boots Healthcare, Glaxo-Smith-Kline, McNeil Pharma (former Woelm Pharma), MSD Sharp & Dohme and Pfizer to the University of Muenster. Blood collection was done through funds from the Institute of Epidemiology and Social Medicine, University of Muenster.

The EPIC-Norfolk study is supported by the Medical Research Council UK and Cancer Research UK.

The EpiDREAM study is supported by the Canadian Institutes for Health Research, Heart and Stroke Foundation of Ontario, Sanofi-Aventis, GlaxoSmithKline and King Pharmaceuticals.
Funding for Andrew Lotery from the LEEDS study was provided by the T.F.C. Frost charity and the Macular Disease Society.

The Rotterdam Study is supported by the Erasmus Medical Center and Erasmus University Rotterdam; the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research; the Netherlands Organization for Health Research and Development (ZonMw); the Research Institute for Diseases in the Elderly; The Netherlands Heart Foundation; the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science; the Ministry of Health Welfare and Sports; the European Commission (DG XII); and the Municipality of Rotterdam. Support for genotyping was provided by the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) (175.010.2005.011, 911.03.012), the Netherlands Genomics Initiative (NGI)/NWO project nr. 050-060-810 and Research Institute for Diseases in the Elderly (RIDE). Abbas Dehghan is supported by a grant from NWO (Vici, 918-76-619).

The SAS study was funded by the British Heart Foundation.

The Swedish Research Council, the Swedish Heart & Lung Foundation and the Stockholm County Council (ALF) supported the SHEEP study.

SMILE was funded by the Netherlands Heart foundation (NHS 92345). Dr Rosendaal is a recipient of the Spinoza Award of the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO) which was used for part of this work.

The Verona Heart Study was funded by grants from the Italian Ministry of University and Research, the Veneto Region, and the Cariverona Foundation, Verona.

The Atherosclerosis Risk in Communities Study is carried out as a collaborative study supported by National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute contracts N01-HC-55015, N01-HC-55016, N01-HC-55018, N01-HC-55019, N01-HC-55020, N01-HC-55021, and N01-HC-55022. The authors thank the staff and participants of the ARIC study for their important contributions.
The KORA (Kooperative Gesundheitsforschung in der Region Augsburg) research platform was initiated and financed by the Helmholtz Zentrum München - National Research Center for Environmental Health, which is funded by the German Federal Ministry of Education, Science, Research and Technology and by the State of Bavaria. Part of this work was financed by the German National Genome Research Network (NGFN-2 and NGFNPlus) and within the Munich Center of Health Sciences (MC Health) as part of LMUinnovativ.